

1 UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
2 FOR THE WESTERN DISTRICT OF LOUISIANA  
3 SHREVEPORT DIVISION

4 AKEEM HENDERSON, et al.,

5 Plaintiffs,

CASE NUMBER

6 vs.

5:19-CV-00163

7 WILLIS-KNIGHTON MEDICAL CENTER  
8 d/b/a Willis-Knighton South  
Hospital,

9 Defendant.

---

10  
11  
12 DEPOSITION OF  
13 RICHARD M. SOBEL, M.D.

14  
15 November 26, 2019

16 10:02 a.m.

17  
18  
19  
20 105 Tivoli Gardens Road  
21 Peachtree City, Georgia 30269  
22 Thomas R. Brezina, CRR, RMR, CCR-B-2035  
23  
24  
25

## 1 APPEARANCES OF COUNSEL

2 On behalf of the Plaintiffs:  
(present via speakerphone)3  
4 SEDRIC E. BANKS, Esquire  
S. HUTTON BANKS, Esquire  
1038 North Ninth  
5 Monroe, Louisiana 71201  
Tel: (318) 388-1655  
6 Fax: (318) 816-5026  
sedbanks@aol.com

7

8 On behalf of the Defendant:

9 LAMAR P. PUGH, Esquire  
Pugh, Pugh & Pugh  
10 333 Texas Street  
Suite 2100  
11 Shreveport, Louisiana 71101-5302  
Tel: (318) 227-2270  
12 Fax: (318) 227-2273  
E-mail: lamar@thepughlawfirm.com

13

14 ROBERT W. ROBISON, JR., Esquire  
Watson, Blanche, Wilson & Posner, LLP  
15 505 North Boulevard  
Baton Rouge, Louisiana 70821  
16 Tel: (225) 387-5511  
Fax: (225) 387-5972  
17 E-mail: Rrobison@wbwplaw.com

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

November 26, 2019

Page 108

1 instance?

2 A Yes.

3 Q And what is your opinion?

4 A There was.

5 Q And again, we're -- but that would be  
6 only to the first visit of February 10th?

7 A Yes.

8 Q In your opinion who was negligent in  
9 the treatment of the patient: The doctor or the  
10 hospital nurses?

11 A Both.

12 Q So it's your opinion that there was a  
13 breach of the standard of care by both the treating  
14 ER physician and hospital nurses in treating this  
15 patient; is that right?

16 A Yes. And the respiratory therapy, if  
17 they even were involved. I haven't been able to  
18 detect the presence of a respiratory therapist yet,  
19 but I haven't excluded the possibility that there  
20 was one involved.

21 Q And so it's also your opinion that the  
22 respiratory therapist breached the standard of care  
23 in the treatment of the patient in this case?

24 A Well, that becomes likely because there  
25 is no documentation, unless there is documentation

1 found on discovery. I don't know if discovery is  
2 complete. But unless there is documentation of the  
3 involvement of a respiratory therapist found, that  
4 would be a breach of the standard of care. You  
5 can't really treat a patient as a respiratory  
6 therapist in an emergency department without any  
7 documentation.

8 Q Do you remember what Mr. Banks told you  
9 about the patient's treatment in this case?  
10 Independent of your review of case, were you told  
11 anything?

12 A You mean what he told me as a thumbnail  
13 sketch of the case --

14 Q Yes, sir.

15 A -- before he sent me the case?

16 Q Yes, sir.

17 A No. I don't specifically recall. I  
18 would assume he told me it was a four-year-old that  
19 had exacerbation of asthma, history of prematurity,  
20 was discharged, and returned to the hospital in  
21 cardiac arrest some three or four hours later.

22 Q Did you actually meet with plaintiffs'  
23 attorney, or just have telephone conversations?

24 A Just telephone conversations.

25 Q Have you ever spoken with this

November 26, 2019

Page 125

1     **that something you rely upon?**

2           A           Oh. Well, I haven't seen any evidence  
3     of the use of any sort of monitor system in this  
4     case. I certainly would like to review it if it  
5     exists.

6           Q           Now, so I can understand that, you  
7     don't see where this patient was monitored in the  
8     hospital?

9           A           No. I see spot checks of the  
10    respirations, pulse oximetry on two occasions. I  
11    don't have any rhythm strips at all, which actually,  
12    I believe is a breach of the standard of care. This  
13    is a patient that should have been on a monitor with  
14    continuous vital signs monitoring: Respiratory  
15    rate, pulse rate, and pulse oximetry. That would be  
16    the standard for a four-year-old presenting in  
17    respiratory distress, all the way through their  
18    transfer likely to another hospital.

19          Q           In your experience in reviewing records  
20    do the hospitals typically include in the record,  
21    the entire strip from such a monitoring system? In  
22    the medical records it stores?

23          A           The entire strip, no. The standard of  
24    care does not require them to preserve an entire  
25    strip, so the standard would require them to

1 preserve evidence of monitoring on an intermittent  
2 basis. Depending on the circumstance, it might be  
3 every five minutes; it might be every 15 minutes,  
4 whatever is appropriate. But some evidence of  
5 continuous monitoring, if they had provided it, is  
6 the standard of care.

7 And to answer, I think, the second part  
8 of your question, I've seen many cases where the  
9 hospital did not properly retain evidence of  
10 continuous monitoring or did not produce evidence of  
11 monitoring right up until the weekend before trial  
12 when it mysteriously appears and it's produced. So  
13 yes, that is a problem.

14 Q In the ERs isn't it true that quite  
15 often the patients are more closely monitored in an  
16 emergency room setting than they are on the floor?

17 A Yes.

18 Q Back to the facts on the bottom of the  
19 page 4, you stated in the last sentence, "She had  
20 been seen on 12/6/17 at the WK South emergency  
21 department for a milder exacerbation of bronchospasm  
22 and discharge."

23 A I think I had lost our place.

24 Q Bottom of page 5. I'm sorry.

25 A Okay.

November 26, 2019

Page 169

1 access. You're going to give intravenous steroids,  
2 not a shot at the end of the day when the child is  
3 almost out the door, but as I said, it's definitely  
4 better than nothing.

5 Q So when this child, assuming that the  
6 doctor is telling the truth in here that she is  
7 improved and that she is no longer in the tripod  
8 position, that she is not using accessory muscles,  
9 you're going to still put an IV in her?

10 A You do that immediately on  
11 presentation.

12 Q On a child --

13 A A four-year-old in a tripod position,  
14 absolutely.

15 Q So the standard of care in your opinion  
16 would be that any child who presents in the tripod  
17 position with an asthma attack, you have to put an  
18 IV in and hospitalize them?

19 A I would say on the order of 99.9 out of  
20 100, that would be the anticipation.

21 Q What if medications are given, DuoNeb  
22 and albuterol, and the breathing problems subside?

23 A Well, it sounds like you're making  
24 progress, getting lucky, but the potential for  
25 material deterioration is clearly still there